

## **PRESENTERS**

### ***Brendan McConnell, Hill Lee & Scott, Christchurch***

Brendan has a general practice but is involved principally in property, including relationship property, commercial and tribunal work. He co-presented a paper entitled *Property Sharing in Domestic Relationships* at the 2000 Property Law Conference. He has a special interest in relationship property issues, particularly contracting out and the overlap of relationship property issues with property purchases and the implication of relationship property issues for property lawyers.

### ***Nicola Peart, Associate Professor of Law, University of Otago***

Nicola was appointed to the Law Faculty at the University of Otago in 1987, where her research has focused on family property law and medical law. She is the principal author of *Relationship Property on Death* due to be published by Brookers in 2004 and co-presented the 2002 NZLS seminar *Claims to Estates of Family Persons*.

*The statements and conclusions contained in this booklet are those of the author(s) only and not those of the New Zealand Law Society. This booklet has been prepared for the purpose of a Continuing Legal Education course. It is not intended to be a comprehensive statement of the law or practice, and should not be relied upon as such. If advice on the law is required, it should be sought on a formal, professional basis.*

# CONTENTS

<b>INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>1</b>
Overview of the Property (Relationships) Act.....	1
<i>Meaning of property</i> .....	1
<i>Major changes made by the PRA</i> .....	2
<b>1. BREACHING A TRUST/COMPANY’S RAMPARTS .....</b>	<b>7</b>
Introduction.....	7
Sections 43 and 44 .....	7
Sections 44C and 44F: dispositions to trusts and companies .....	8
Section 44C.....	8
<i>Disposition</i> .....	9
<i>Dispositions made since the marriage or de facto relationship began</i> .....	9
<i>The disposition must have been made by either or both spouses or de facto partners</i> .....	9
<i>The disposition must be of “relationship property”</i> .....	10
<i>The disposition must not be one to which s 44 applies</i> .....	10
<i>Disposition having the effect of defeating claim or rights of one of parties</i> .....	10
<i>Meaning of “defeat”</i> .....	10
<i>Time at which the effect of the disposition is to be assessed</i> .....	11
<i>Summary</i> .....	12
<i>Remedies</i> .....	13
Section 44F .....	13
<i>Remedies</i> .....	14
Varying the terms of a trust: s 33(3)(m) .....	14
<i>Sections 10, 25, 33(3)(m)</i> .....	15
<i>Sections 25 and 33(3)(m)</i> .....	16
<i>Summary</i> .....	18
Sham/Alter ego .....	18
<i>Relationship property</i> .....	19
<i>Constructive trust</i> .....	19
<i>Sham transactions</i> .....	20
<i>“Alter ego” trusts</i> .....	22
<i>True nature of transaction</i> .....	23
<i>Traditional trustee law principles</i> .....	28
<i>Conclusion</i> .....	35
<i>Factors loosening the mortar of the trust’s ramparts</i> .....	36
<i>Section 182 Family Proceedings Act</i> .....	37
<i>Other remedies</i> .....	38
<i>Summary</i> .....	38
<b>2. SHORING UP THE RAMPARTS .....</b>	<b>41</b>
<i>Administration</i> .....	41
<i>Contracting out agreements</i> .....	42
<i>Family home</i> .....	42
<i>Cause fatale</i> .....	42
<i>Independent or third party settlor</i> .....	43
<i>Memorandum of wishes</i> .....	43
<i>Trusteeships</i> .....	44
<i>Mirror trusts</i> .....	44
Common methodologies: acquisition of assets.....	45

<i>Borrowing by settlor and on-lending</i> .....	45
<i>Transfer of a property subject to an existing mortgage</i> .....	45
<i>Purchase at market value with retention of borrowings by settlor</i> .....	45
<i>Purchase and borrowing by trust directly</i> .....	46
<i>Adherence to formalities</i> .....	46
<i>Transfer to a company</i> .....	47
<i>Transfer to company in which trust is the shareholder</i> .....	47
<i>Transfer to another person</i> .....	48
<i>Purchase by trust from a third party</i> .....	48
Summary.....	48
<b>3. SECTION 21 AGREEMENTS: CONTRACTING OUT AGREEMENTS .....</b>	<b>49</b>
Contracting out agreements generally.....	49
Contracting out / Settlement agreements .....	49
<i>Certainty of contract</i> .....	49
<i>Serious injustice</i> .....	51
<i>Meaning of “serious injustice”</i> .....	53
<i>Certainty of contract / the parties’ wishes</i> .....	54
<i>Conclusion</i> .....	56
Contracting out agreements in asset planning .....	57
<i>Sections 44C and 44F</i> .....	57
<i>Section 182 of the Family Proceedings Act</i> .....	57
<i>Alter ego trusts and companies</i> .....	58
<i>Section 44</i> .....	58
<i>Section 9A</i> .....	58
<i>Section 10</i> .....	58
<i>Conclusion</i> .....	59
Property purchases .....	59
Other transactions .....	60
<i>Joint tenancy</i> .....	63
<i>Gifting</i> .....	63
<i>General</i> .....	64
<b>4. PROTECTION OF CREDITORS UNDER THE PRA .....</b>	<b>65</b>
Section 47(1).....	65
Section 47(2).....	65
<b>5. ESTATE PLANNING .....</b>	<b>67</b>
Rights of the surviving spouse or partner under the PRA .....	68
<i>Effect of option A</i> .....	68
<i>Claims under Family Protection Act and Testamentary Promises Act</i> .....	69
<i>Division under option A</i> .....	69
Example of PRA impact on estate plan .....	71
Rights of the estate under the PRA.....	72
<b>6. ADVISING POST DEATH.....</b>	<b>75</b>
Conflict of interest .....	75
<i>Lawyers acting as co-executors</i> .....	75
Advising the surviving spouse or partner .....	75
<i>Time limits</i> .....	75
<i>Formalities</i> .....	76
<i>Default option</i> .....	77

<i>Advising on choice of option</i> .....	77
<i>Distribution</i> .....	78
<i>Final distribution</i> .....	79
<i>Setting aside chosen option</i> .....	79
<i>Priority</i> .....	81
<i>Classification of property under option A</i> .....	81
Acting for the estate .....	82
<i>Distribution</i> .....	82
Acting for estate beneficiaries or claimants.....	83
<i>Application to be heard</i> .....	83
<i>Appointment of personal representative to make PRA claim</i> .....	83
<i>Effect of granting leave</i> .....	85
Conclusion .....	87